

CC GOVERNANCE & LOCAL APPROPRIATIONS

Table 1. Taxonomy of community college governance structures (2015)

Coordinating/ governing board for CCs separate from K-12 & 4-year. (19)	Same coordinating/ governing board as K- 12 but separate from 4-year (2)	Same coordinating/ governing board as 4- year (22)	Coordination for CC governance falls under a P-20 board (1)	Coordination for CC governance falls beneath a 4-year coordinating/ governing board (3)	No state-level coordinating or governing board (3)
Alabama California Colorado Delaware Georgia Illinois Kentucky Louisiana Maine Mississippi New Hampshire New Jersey North Carolina South Carolina Virginia Washington West Virginia Wisconsin Wyoming	Iowa Florida	Arkansas Connecticut Indiana Kansas Massachusetts s Maryland Michigan Minnesota Missouri Montana Nebraska Nevada New Mexico North Dakota Ohio Oklahoma Oregon Rhode Island Tennessee Texas Utah Vermont	Idaho	Alaska Hawaii New York	Arizona Pennsylvania South Dakota

Adapted from Fletcher and Friedel (2016). States that underwent a governance change at any point in our panel are bolded. Discrepancy in categorization existed in Fletcher and Friedel (2016) between survey results of state community college directors and document analysis. To remedy, we added a category for P-20 governing/coordinating structures and cross referenced Tollefson, Garrett, and Ingram (1999) and state websites. Categorization necessitates a loss of nuance; however, we took many steps to ensure that our characterization of a state’s governance structure is accurate.

Table 2. Taxonomy of community college governance structures (2000)

Coordinating/ governing board for CCs separate from K-12 & 4-year (21)	Same coordinating/ governing board as K- 12 but separate from 4-year (1)	Same coordinating/ governing board as 4- year (20)	Coordination for CC governance falls under a P-20 board (2)	Coordination for CC governance falls beneath a 4-year coordinating/ governing board (3)	No state-level coordinating or governing board (3)
Alabama	Iowa	Arkansas	Idaho	Alaska	Georgia
Arizona		Indiana	Oregon	Hawaii	Pennsylvania
California		Kansas		New York	South Dakota
Colorado		Massachusetts			
Connecticut		s			
Delaware		Maryland			
Florida		Michigan			
Illinois		Minnesota			
Kentucky		Missouri			
Louisiana		Montana			
Maine		Nebraska			
Mississippi		Nevada			
New Hampshire		New Mexico			
New Jersey		North Dakota			
North Carolina		Ohio			
South Carolina		Oklahoma			
Virginia		Rhode Island			
Washington		Tennessee			
West Virginia		Texas			
Wisconsin		Utah			
Wyoming		Vermont			

Categorization is adapted from Fletcher and Friedel (2016) using Tollefson, Garrett, and Ingram (1999) and state websites. Categorization necessitates a loss of nuance; however, we took many steps to ensure that our characterization of a state's governance structure is accurate.

Table 3. Variable definitions

Variable	Description	Source
<i>Organization & Policy Context</i>		
Community College Governing/Coordinating Structure	The variable was constructed utilizing prior typology research (Fletcher & Friedel, 2017; Tollefson, Garrett, & Ingram, 1999) and publicly available resources. A dichotomous variable for each governance category constructed by following the taxonomy outlined in Katsinas (1996) and further expanded upon by Fletcher and Friedel (2017). To begin, we used Tollefson, Garrett, and Ingram's (1999) book of state community college governance summaries and compared it to Fletcher and Friedel's (2017) summary. In instances in which the governance structure changed between 1999 and 2015, we utilized online, publicly available resources to identify the year in which the change occurred and the type of governance change. To further ensure validity, we vetted the independent variable against internet searches for the name of each state's governing board and change and/or history.	Katsinas, 1996 Fletcher & Friedel, 2016 Education Commission of the States (ECS) Various state government websites
FTE Enrollment	The aggregate full-time equivalent (FTE) enrollment at all institutions in a state. This variable represents the total FTE enrollment for a given state.	Delta Cost Project
State Appropriations	The total aggregated amount of funds appropriated to institutions through acts of a state legislative body (except grants and contracts and capital appropriations). Funds reported in this category are for meeting current operating expenses, not for specific projects or programs.	Delta Cost Project
Share of Community College Students out of All Public Enrollees	The number of FTE enrollment of students in the two-year public sector out of all FTE enrollments in the public sector.	Delta Cost Project

Politico-Institutional Context

State Citizen Ideology	Measurement of citizen ideology through the identification of ideological positions of Congress using interest group ratings, ideology scores for district incumbents, ideology scores for (real or hypothetical) challengers, and election results reflecting ideological divisions in electorate.	Richard Fording Dataverse (Berry, Ringquist, Fording, & Hanson, 2009)
Percent of the Legislature Identified as Democrat	Measure of state government ideology; the percent of democrats in the state legislature.	Klarner, C. (2013). State partisan balance data, 1937 - 2011. Retrieved from: https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/LZHMG3
Governor Power Index	Gubernatorial Power Index Derived variable measuring relative gubernatorial power, calculated as the sum of the governor's constitutionally granted powers (between 0 and 4) divided by the highest power index attainable (maximum of 4).	Council of State Governments Book of the States
<i>Socioeconomic Context</i>		
State Population	The total number of individuals residing within the state in a given year.	U.S. Census ACS
Income Inequality (Gini Coefficient)	An index measuring the concentration of wealth within the state, ranging from 0 to 1. A value of 0 indicates total equality (all households have equal wealth) and a value of 1 indicates total inequality (one household has all the wealth).	U.S. Census Current Population Survey (CPS) Annual Social and Economic Supplement (ASEC)
Unemployment Rate	The percent of persons unemployed as calculated by the Bureau of Labor Statistics from the Current Population Survey (CPS). According to the CPS, persons are classified as unemployed if they do not have a job, have actively looked for work in the prior 4 weeks, and are currently available for work. Persons who were not working and were waiting to be recalled to a job from which they had been temporarily laid off are also included as unemployed. Receiving benefits from the Unemployment Insurance (UI) program has no bearing on whether a person is classified as unemployed.	Bureau of Labor Statistics

Appendix A: Equations

Fixed effects:

$$(1) \text{LocalAppropsFTE}_{it} = \alpha + \beta_1 \text{CCg}_{it} + \beta_2 \text{PEC}_{it} + \mu_i + \delta_i + \eta_t + \varepsilon_{it}$$

$\text{LocalAppropsFTE}_{it}$:	Dollar amount of local appropriations per FTE for an individual state i in year t
β_1 :	Regression coefficients corresponding to one of the two categorical variables created to represent state governance arrangements for community colleges
β_2 :	Regression coefficients corresponding to control variables from the policy ecology framework
μ_i :	Constant for the states
δ_i :	State effects term
η :	Time effects term
ε_{it} :	A random error term for state i at time t

Fixed effects with interaction terms:

$$(2) \text{LocalAppropsFTE}_{it}$$

$$= \alpha + \beta_1 \text{CCg}_{it} + \beta_2 \text{PEC}_{it} + \beta_3 \text{CCg}_{it} * \text{PEC}_{it} + \mu_i + \delta_i + \eta_t + \varepsilon_{it}$$

$\text{LocalAppropsFTE}_{it}$:	Dollar amount of local appropriations per FTE for an individual state i in year t
β_1 :	Regression coefficients corresponding to one of the two categorical variables created to represent state governance arrangements for community colleges
β_2 :	Regression coefficients corresponding to control variables from the policy ecology framework
β_3 :	Regression coefficients corresponding to interaction terms between the governance variable and policy ecology controls
μ_i :	Constant for the states
δ_i :	State effects term
η :	Time effects term
ε_{it} :	A random error term for state i at time t